

# Evidence to the STRB (Remit for the 27<sup>th</sup> Report)

December 2016

**UCAC** | yr undeb sy'n diogelu athrawon a darlithwyr Cymru

## Evidence to the STRB (Remit for the 27<sup>th</sup> Report)

**What adjustments should be made to the salary and allowance ranges for classroom teachers, unqualified teachers and school leaders to promote recruitment within the 1% limit for pay awards for public sector workers.**

### 1. Introduction

- 1.1. UCAC welcomes this opportunity to provide evidence to the STRB on teachers' pay and conditions. UCAC represents thousands of teachers in Wales, including head teachers and others in leadership posts.
- 1.2. UCAC believes that it is important to comment on the constraints within the original Remit which limit the scope of the STRB's recommendations and remove a significant element of independence from the work. The Government has already taken the decision to limit public sector pay awards yet again in 2017-18 to an average of 1% and the STRB's work is to determine how this average pay award should be alloted with a focus on addressing recruitment and retention pressures. UCAC believes that such a Remit undermines the role of the STRB and the reason why it was initially set up (under the School Teachers' Pay and Conditions Act 1991 / Education Act 2002).
- 1.3. Even though the UK Government currently holds the responsibility for decisions on teachers' pay and conditions, it does not fulfil the corresponding responsibility of gathering sufficient data and evidence about the teaching workforce in Wales in order to understand the workforce for which it holds such an important responsibility.
- 1.4. The STRB's most recent report (26th Report), as with earlier reports, contains recommendations for teachers in Wales and England yet the majority of the statistics within the Report refer to teachers in England.
- 1.5. The Welsh Government has started a long term project to improve the collection of data about the teaching workforce but we are currently in a position in Wales where there is insufficient concrete data concerning recruitment and retention issues. In UCAC's opinion the data available in Wales for workforce planning is not robust enough and does not provide sufficient information about the number of teachers required to work in the different sectors (primary, secondary, bilingual, Welsh Medium) or to teach specific subjects or within particular key stages; it does not highlight current or future shortage areas. The information gathered at present about the current workforce is not sufficient to give a clear, detailed analysis of the numbers required or available to work in these sectors and how many new teachers we need to train.
- 1.6. We do, however, have a variety of data about registered teachers from the Education Workforce Council and PLASC census, i.e. all teachers working in a local authority maintained school or able to do so. These statistics help to inform our judgements in this evidence.

### 2. 1% average pay rise

- 2.1. UCAC believes that a 1% pay award for 2017-18 is not acceptable. There has been a significant cumulative loss in gross pay for teachers from September 2010 which will continue in 2016-17.
- 2.2. There is a strong case for a far higher pay rise for all teachers and one that the Government must fund fully. The STRB's 26<sup>th</sup> Report refers to the need for a pay rise "*significantly higher than 1%... in the course of this parliament,*" if current recruitment and retention issues continue. There is no reason to believe that they will not continue and another proposed 1% pay uplift will do nothing to get to grips with the problems; it can only be detrimental to the profession and the education system as a whole.
- 2.3. UCAC is convinced that there is a strong case for an above 1% pay increase across the board. In addition to the significant reduction in take home pay year on year, teachers also faced a

further increase in pension contributions in April 2015. With the loss of the contracted out concession to National Insurance payments which was imposed in April 2016 the take home pay of all teachers has been reduced by 1.4%. The 1% increase (September 2016) has had no positive impact on teachers' pay in real terms.

- 2.4. There is a need for a significant increase in pay to ensure that teaching can compete in the graduate labour market.
- 2.5. Pay is an important factor as it provides recognition for the demands of the role and its status - and the fact that teachers' pay is lagging behind must be addressed if we are to increase the status of the profession and attract graduates to the career as a first choice career.
- 2.6. UCAC disagrees with the notion of an average pay award in principle. UCAC believes that the cost of living pay rise should be applicable to all teachers and that there can be no real justification for the STRB to recommend a different course of action. An uplift to the minima and maxima of all classroom teacher, leadership pay ranges and allowances in the national pay framework will potentially exclude a significant number of teachers from any increase. UCAC believes that this is unacceptable.
- 2.7. A compulsory uplift to the minima and maxima of pay ranges and allowances with no guaranteed pay uplift or pay rise for other teachers could leave almost 50% of teachers at the risk of being without any pay rise: the STRB in its 26<sup>th</sup> Report refers to 44% of the profession not on the minima or maxima of a range 2013/14 (Para 2.9).
- 2.8. Targeting higher levels of pay at individuals or groups within the profession is not the answer. We need to address teachers' pay generally. There must be a real terms increase for **all** teachers.
- 2.9. UCAC disagrees fundamentally with the Department's past arguments about greater flexibility, performance related pay, targeting pay increases and paying non- consolidated increases. The Department seems to be arguing in favour of further complicating the pay framework.
- 2.10. Teachers' hours are not defined and excessive hours have become the norm - hours that would for others be classed as overtime are, therefore, unpaid for teachers. We need to address these excessive hours as well as recognize the huge contribution that teachers make to our society.

### 3. Issues affecting recruitment and retention

#### Pupil numbers

- 3.1. As the increased numbers of pupils go through the system we are seeing significant increases and there will be a need for more teachers in the secondary sector by 2019 at the latest.
- 3.2. According to PLASC figures January 2016:
  - The total number of pupils in Local Authority School in Wales was 466,555 – a rise of 851 pupils since January 2015.
  - The numbers of pupils aged 5-10 years old have increased from 203,847 in 2015 to 207,328 in 2016
  - Since 2006, the numbers of pupils aged under 5 years old have been increasing. This reversed a long-term downward trend.
  - Increasing numbers in the primary sector will soon have an impact on the secondary sector.
- 3.3. Within the context of the rise in pupil population, and a projected rise in pupil numbers of 13,400 (between 2014-2022), Wales will be depending more and more on returners to the profession up to 2022. We need to make the profession attractive to those who have taken a career break and we need to make it attractive for new graduates and career changers

- 3.4. At a time when there is a greater number of graduate vacancies in general, teaching must become an attractive career option and it is not viewed as such, generally, at present.

#### 4. Recruitment to Initial Teacher Education Courses

- 4.1. The Welsh Government's current Teacher Planning Supply Model (TPSM) merely sets a cap on numbers to recruit to Initial Teacher Training Courses.
- 4.2. In the 2016-17 academic year, only one of the Universities involved in the delivery of Initial Teacher Training courses filled its quota of places. The others failed to attract sufficient numbers to their courses.
- 4.3. We are also aware from anecdotal evidence substantiated by information from EWC that:
- some students fail to complete the course
  - some students decide not to continue with teaching as a career once qualified
  - some NQTs leave Wales to work elsewhere
  - some NQTs change direction early in their career – within the first five years of teaching.
- 4.4. Workload issues are often cited as the reason for leaving the profession and changing direction during training.
- 4.5. Tax-free incentives ranging from £3,000 - £20,000 are offered, depending on class of first degree and specialism, to attract graduates to specific PGCE courses in Wales (see Annex 1).
- 4.6. There is also the possibility of some financial help to attract students to Welsh medium courses - teaching through the medium of Welsh is a growth area.
- 4.7. Clearly significant sums of money can be paid during the training period, with no guarantee that this investment will ensure that the student teacher will commit to becoming a teacher, once qualified.
- 4.8. The high priority subjects: mathematics, physics, chemistry and Welsh can attract incentives from £6,000 to £20,000 while a Newly Qualified Teacher receives £22,467 annual pay **before deductions**. It seems inherently unfair that someone can receive more money when training to become a teacher than a qualified teacher working full time takes home as net pay.
- 4.9. The Welsh Government is currently undertaking a review of these incentives and their value as a recruitment and retention tool. UCAC acknowledges that such sums of money may well be successful in recruiting graduates to the ITT course but we believe that there is no evidence to suggest that the incentives have any impact on retention in the profession once the ITT course is over.
- 4.10. As employment opportunities increase for graduates, UCAC believes that we are more likely to lose more potential teachers and teachers from the education system.

#### 5. Recruitment and retention problems

- 5.1. In UCAC's opinion, the current graduate pay situation in the wider market, as well as differences in working conditions and potential for career progression, all have an impact on
- recruitment to ITT courses
  - levels of satisfaction within the profession
  - retention after achieving qualified status.
- 5.2. UCAC believes that it is essential to deal with workload issues and also ensure fair pay for teachers throughout their career in order to be able to retain people within the profession.

- 5.3. UCAC is aware of the challenges to recruit and retain teachers. Retention is a specific issue affected at this time by pay, workload and low morale within the profession.
- 5.4. Local recruitment issues can be masked by national or regional statistics based on average number of applicants for a post. Specific challenges in particular geographical areas or for particular posts (with possibly no candidates for some posts and less than 3-4 for others) are masked within such statistics.
- 5.5. There are certainly challenges in Wales and they can vary depending on geographical areas, e.g. schools in South West Wales, South East Wales, the North West and the North East will face their own challenges - perhaps the challenge of attracting new teachers to a rural area, of finding teachers who can teach through the medium of Welsh, attracting to a head teacher post, attracting suitable supply teachers, and there are certainly shortage subject areas.
- 5.6. We are also aware of difficulties ensuring that we have a diverse workforce in Wales, e.g.
- 86.1% of teachers in Wales have identified as being White British
  - only 0.2% of teachers in Wales have made a declaration whilst registering with the EWC in accordance with the Equality Act 2010.
- 5.7. As the Welsh Government prepares to implement the new Curriculum for Wales and also its new strategy for the Welsh Language, Miliwn o Siaradwyr Cymraeg (a long term strategy aiming for a Million Welsh Speakers by 2050), we will need more teachers who can speak Welsh, teach through the medium of Welsh and / or teach Welsh as a subject.
- 5.8. There are clear differences in numbers of teachers who are able to speak Welsh, teach through the medium of Welsh and / or teach Welsh as a second language within the four Consortia regions. The available figures do not show us current shortages in particular schools or regions but they can highlight challenges we are likely to face in the future.

## 6. EWC statistics taken from EWC Regional Consortium Statistics Nov.2015)

Y / N / U	CSCJES		GWE		EAS		ERW		TOTAL
	No. of school teachers	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	
Yes	2,215	24.2	3,948	52.8	945	17.3	3,788	41	10,896
No	6,150	67.2	3,230	43.2	4,061	74.2	4,782	51.8	18,223
Unknown	786	8.6	294	3.9	467	8.5	661	7.2	2,208
Total	9,151	100	7,472	100	5,473	100	9,231	100	31,327

Figure 1: Teachers able to speak Welsh according to Consortia Region

Y / N / U	CSCJES		GWE		EAS		ERW		TOTAL
	No. of school teachers	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	
Yes	1,741	19.0	3,450	46.2	732	13.4	3,176	34.4	9,099
No	6,609	72.2	3,713	49.7	4,259	77.8	5,385	58.3	19,966
Unknown	801	8.8	309	4.1	482	8.8	670	7.3	2,262
Total	9,151	100	7,472	100	5,473	100	9,231	100	31,327

Figure 2: Teachers able to teach through the medium of Welsh according to Consortia Region

- 6.1. We can see from EWC figures that all consortia regions at present fall short of the number of teachers and head teachers with relevant skills in Welsh to deliver the requirements of a Curriculum for Wales and *Miliwn o Siaradwyr Cymraeg*, with GwE and ERW being in the strongest position but the two other consortia regions have a long way to go to catch up. All regions need to plan to develop this section of the workforce and we need to plan ITT (ITE from now on) intakes more strategically.
- 6.2. We are also aware of issues recruiting to head teacher posts, sometimes in specific areas or in the Welsh medium sector and this tends to be a general issue affecting all sectors.
- 6.3. There has been a consistent reduction in the number of head teachers in Wales since the then GTCW started gathering information. This is due to a number of factors, including school closures and head teachers becoming responsible for two or more schools, very often as a result of head teacher recruitment issues.
- 6.4. There are also too few women in head teacher roles, considering the percentage of women within the profession.
- 6.5. The latest figures available are for 2013 but are likely to be updated during the course of this Remit.

## 7. School Leaders

- 7.1. The number of registered head teachers has fallen annually since the GTCW started publishing the Statistics Digest and although we have seen an increase in the number of female head teachers the numbers do not correspond with the percentage of female teachers within the profession in Wales:

*“The number of headteachers who are registered with GTCW has fallen annually since the Annual Statistics Digest was introduced. This is explained by the reduction in the number of schools in Wales and increasingly headteachers covering more than one school particularly in rural areas. As at the 1st March 2013, 60 (3.7%) registered headteachers covered two or more schools.*

*The number of female headteachers has increased annually over the last 10 years. However, if one considers that 75% of all registered teachers in Wales are female compared to 57% of all headteachers there remains an underrepresentation of female headteachers in Wales. This is particularly apparent in the secondary sector where only 29.6% of headteachers are female.”*

From GTCW Headteacher Data Analysis – August 2013

- 7.2. We are also in a position where some acting head teachers (without a NPQH qualification) are in post for considerable periods of time due to lack of candidates for the permanent post. The NPQH is currently a mandatory qualification for headship in Wales.
- 7.3. We are also aware of a trend for teachers to work part time due to family commitments (or otherwise) or to step down from posts with responsibility, in order to be able to achieve some form of work-life balance. Part time teachers are often wrongly not considered suitable for roles with responsibility and are not encouraged or supported to consider middle or senior leadership roles.
- 7.4. As we lose people from the system completely or partially, we are also losing potential future school leaders.

## 8. Starting salaries

- 8.1. In its 26<sup>th</sup> report, the STRB notes (Para.2.8) that “Over the last decade, teachers’ median earnings have grown at a slower rate than earnings across both the economy as a whole and the public sector.”



- 8.2. We cannot allow this trend to continue as it damages recruitment and retention. Table 1 Para. 2.15 of the Report highlights, in particular, the issue of teacher starting salaries in comparison with median starting salaries for graduates. This is also a concern when considering the issue of recruitment.
- 8.3. The starting salary is, of course, important to attract people initially to the profession. It is also likely that salary progression influences students when considering career choices, e.g. the potential earnings after 5 years / 10 years, etc.; and a career structure that allows pay progression, promotion and further recognition.
- 8.4. Teachers' starting salaries must become more competitive. It is important that teachers' pay compares favourably with the pay of other graduate professions at the beginning of their career and at various stages, including 10 years on.
- 8.5. A well-defined pay structure, with opportunities for pay progression and career development, must be clear to those who may be considering the profession as a career choice. Performance related pay is not a clear element of a pay structure for teaching, considering the nature of the work involved. UCAC believes that Performance Related Pay is not a useful or viable element of the pay structure for the teaching workforce.

## 9. Public sector and private sector pay

- 9.1. Growth in regular pay during 2015 / 2016 in Wales was greater than the public sector increases of 1% average.
- 9.2. The UK Government has claimed in the past that the average public sector weekly wage is higher than the average private sector wage and UCAC believes that this is misleading. Private sector jobs are often less well paid because they require fewer qualifications or less experience or skill. The Institute for Fiscal Studies' Report: *Public Sector Pay in the UK* (October 2014) reveals the complexities of making comparisons between the public and private sectors.
- 9.3. We also need to take into account the increase in privatisation and contracting out the less skilled posts in the public sector. There were significant changes in the 1980s and early 1990s, and it is estimated that further significant changes have taken place since, e.g. approximately a fifth of the remaining public sector cleaning jobs have moved to the private sector since 1997.
- 9.4. We have a largely better qualified and more highly skilled public sector workforce than in the past. Figures about average salary within the public sector are misleading, as we are dealing with posts which require a largely better educated and more highly skilled workforce.
- 9.5. The situation where pay is concerned is complex, as people with degrees tend to be better paid, on average, in the private sector, while those with diplomas, other qualifications or no qualifications tend to do better in the public sector.
- 9.6. According to the Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings, the median gross weekly earnings for full-time employees were up 2.2% in April 2016 from 2015 and with an adjustment for inflation earnings increased by 1.9% compared with 2015. This increase is the joint highest since the recession. (**Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings UK (ASHE) - Office for National Statistics** – based on provisional estimates).
- 9.7. It is very difficult to find a comparative post to teaching within the private sector in Wales apart from in private schools – there are 66 in Wales (PLASC 2016) – and the Welsh Government has no intention of introducing academies or free schools in Wales as it is committed to the comprehensive education system. UCAC does not believe that those local businesses in Wales, be they farms, shops, solicitors, private dentists, accountants, chemists, supermarkets, etc, are competing with the public sector in Wales for teachers or for the graduates who become teachers.

## 10. Impact of recent reforms

- 10.1. The reforms have thus far had little impact on teachers' pay in Wales. There has been a determination on the part of unions and employers to work together to ensure a cost of living pay increase of 1% for all teachers and to aim for as much consistency as possible across Wales.
- 10.2. The reforms have complicated the pay system and it is not possible to determine how likely a teacher is to move to higher points within the range, or to understand what the next steps are for his/her pay, when the points are not defined and when pay portability can be denied.
- 10.3. The 1% increase over recent years and the reforms to the teachers' pay structure have done nothing to improve the starting salary for those entering the profession compared with other graduate professions or to make remuneration of the profession more attractive.

## 11. Teachers' pay and the status of the profession

- 11.1. UCAC believes that we need to address the public perception of teaching as a profession, the status of teaching as a career, the way our children, young people and their parents view teachers. One important step in this process would be to ensure that teachers' remuneration reflects the value that should be placed on the role of teachers. A 1% average pay rise will do nothing but allow teachers' pay to continue to fall behind the pay of other graduates.
- 11.2. UCAC believes that the whole issue of teachers' pay needs to be reconsidered and that the STRB should report on what is considered to be a "significant pay rise" as referred to in the 26<sup>th</sup> Report.
- 11.3. The Government should then set a clear timeline and provide funding to implement this pay rise.

## UCAC December 2016

### Annex 1

Incentive payments for recruitment to Initial Teacher Training Courses in Wales 2016-17

First degree qualification of student	Mathematics, physics, chemistry, Welsh	Modern languages, ICT(computer sciences)	All other main secondary and subjects & primary	Mathematics, English, Welsh, and Science as degree subject specialism (to improve standards in literacy and numeracy and support teaching in core subjects within Primary schools)
1st	£20,000	£15,000	£3,000	£3,000
2.1	£10,000	£6,000	£0	£0
2.2	£6,000	£0	£0	£0






**UCAC**  
Undeb  
Cenedlaethol  
Athrawon  
Cymru



Prif Swyddfa **UCAC**, Ffordd Penglais, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion SY23 2EU

ffôn: 01970 639950 | ffacs: 01970 626765 | [ucac@ucac.cymru](mailto:ucac@ucac.cymru)

 [facebook.com/AthrawonCymru](https://facebook.com/AthrawonCymru)  [twitter.com/AthrawonCymru](https://twitter.com/AthrawonCymru)

[www.ucac.cymru](http://www.ucac.cymru)